# Article information:

A part of, yet apart from the team: Substantive membership and belonging of trans and nonbinary athletes - Greey - 2023 - Canadian Review of Sociology/Revue canadienne de sociologie - Wiley Online Library
<https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1111/cars.12415>

# Article summary:

1. Trans and nonbinary athletes face both institutional and interactional barriers to substantive membership in sports teams.

2. Substantive membership is a relational and interactional status that requires recognition from other community members, and can be denied or revoked.

3. Interactional methods for signalling non-belonging include denying access to appropriate clothing or facilities, deadnaming or misgendering, and favouring normative gender expressions in media representation.

# Article rating:

May be slightly imbalanced: The article presents the information in a generally reliable way, but there are minor points of consideration that could be explored further or claims that are not fully backed by appropriate evidence. Some perspectives may also be omitted, and you are encouraged to use the research topics section to explore the topic further.

# Article analysis:

The article "A part of, yet apart from the team: Substantive membership and belonging of trans and nonbinary athletes" by Greey (2023) provides a critical analysis of the experiences of trans and nonbinary athletes in sports. The author draws on two case studies to argue that both institutional and interactional factors impact trans athlete inclusion in sport. While formal institutional rules govern trans athletes’ ability to compete in sport, informal social sanctioning also functions to deny trans athletes equitable, or even de facto, membership in sport.

The article is well-written and provides valuable insights into the challenges faced by trans and nonbinary athletes. However, there are some potential biases and limitations that need to be considered. Firstly, the article relies heavily on anecdotal evidence from two case studies, which may not be representative of all trans and nonbinary athletes' experiences. While these stories provide powerful examples of discrimination and exclusion, they do not necessarily reflect the broader experiences of this population.

Secondly, the article focuses primarily on interactional factors that impact trans athlete inclusion in sport but does not explore other important factors such as structural barriers or systemic discrimination. For example, while the author briefly mentions corporate sponsorships being awarded exclusively to femininely attractive boxers, they do not delve deeper into how this reinforces gender norms and excludes masculine/androgynous boxers from opportunities within the sport.

Thirdly, while the article acknowledges that its focus is on citizenship within sporting communities rather than citizenship within the nation-state, it does not fully explore how this distinction impacts its analysis. The concept of substantive citizenship is useful for understanding how recognition and belonging are crucial determinants of citizenship within a community. However, it is unclear how this concept can be applied beyond sporting communities or how it intersects with broader issues related to citizenship rights for marginalized populations.

Finally, while the article highlights some potential risks for trans and nonbinary athletes in sports such as misrecognition or difficulty accessing locker rooms, it does not fully explore other risks such as physical harm or violence that may result from competing against cisgender athletes who may perceive them as a threat to their own gender identity.

In conclusion, while "A part of yet apart from the team" provides valuable insights into the challenges faced by trans and nonbinary athletes in sports, it has some potential biases and limitations that need to be considered. The article's reliance on anecdotal evidence limits its generalizability; its focus on interactional factors overlooks other important structural barriers; its application of substantive citizenship needs further exploration; and its discussion of risks could be more comprehensive. Nonetheless, this article contributes to an important conversation about inclusivity in sports for marginalized populations.

# Topics for further research:

* Structural barriers for trans and nonbinary athletes in sports
* Systemic discrimination against trans and nonbinary athletes in sports
* Gender norms and exclusion of masculine/androgynous boxers in sports
* Intersection of substantive citizenship with broader issues of citizenship rights
* Physical harm and violence against trans and nonbinary athletes in sports
* Corporate sponsorships and their impact on gender norms in sports

# Report location:

<https://www.fullpicture.app/item/fd69c37dc38a7967aee0216c75920042>